AIDS IN HAITI: AN ISLAND OF HOPE AND DESPAIR  By Liz Morrison

Liz Morrison is the coordinator of social studies for the Parkway School District located in west St. Louis County. In 2001 Liz was selected as the National Council for the Social Studies Secondary Teacher of the Year. Liz was the featured guest on Talk of the Nation in September 2002 regarding teaching 9/11 and other “hot topics” in public high schools. In addition, Liz Morrison’s work with controversial issues in the classroom was featured in the Annenberg program “Social Studies in Action.”

OVERVIEW
In this lesson, students will participate in a class discussion using the articles by Antigone Barton focusing on the work of Drs. Paul Farmer in Cange and Jean Pape in Port-au-Prince. Students will discuss the statement “Haiti is an island of hope and despair” utilizing the articles and videos from the Pulitzer Center On Crisis Reporting website. The students will also discuss how the United States and/or its citizens have contributed to hope and despair in Haiti.

CURRICULUM STANDARDS (MCREL)

- Civics: Standard 22. Understands how the world is organized politically into nation-states, how nation-states interact with one another, and issues surrounding U.S. foreign policy
  - Benchmark 2. Knows the most important means used by nation-states to interact with one another (e.g., trade, diplomacy, treaties and agreements, humanitarian aid, economic incentives and sanctions, military force and the threat of force)
- Geography: Standard 1. Understands the characteristics and uses of maps, globes, and other geographic tools and technologies
- Geography: Standard 6. Understands that culture and experience influence people’s perceptions of places and regions
- Language Arts: Standard 10. Understands the characteristics and components of the media
  - Benchmark 12. Understands the role of the media in addressing social and cultural issues

TIME REQUIRED
Two 45-minute class periods or one 90-minute block: Building background knowledge (45 minutes) and Socratic Seminar (45 minutes)
Note – the lesson can be completed in 45 – 50 minutes if the students are assigned the reading as homework the night before the class.

MATERIALS
- Articles by Antigone Barton-Cange, Haiti (Dr. Paul Farmer) and Port-au-Prince (Jean Pape)
- AIDS in the Caribbean Map (http://hivinsite.ucsf.edu/global?page=cr02-00-00)
- Time Line of PEPFAR (Additional Resources)
- Map of the Caribbean (Additional Resources)
- Hope and Despair T- Chart (Additional Resources)
- Four pieces of chart paper (2 per group) OR the students can write on the board
- Scoring Guide – Reflective Writing
- Scoring Guide – Reflective Cartoon
**THE LESSON**

**Student Preparation**

1. Assign the reading as homework if you would like to complete the lesson in one 45-50 minute class period.

**Anticipatory Set**

1. Distribute the blank maps of the Caribbean.
   a. Ask the students to label Haiti.
   b. Project a map or use a pull down map to illustrate the location of Haiti to the United States.
   c. Discuss what the students notice (e.g. proximity to the U.S., size, general location)

2. Write the statement “Haiti is an island of hope and despair” on the board.
   a. Ask the students to write down a personal definition for “hope” and a personal definition of “despair”
   b. Discuss the definitions
   c. Write a class definition for each word

**Procedures**

1. Introduction
   a. Project the map of AIDS in the Caribbean.
   b. Ask the students, “Based on the map, do you think the situation in Haiti is one of hope or despair?” and follow up with, “Why do you think that?”
   c. Explain that the students are going to be reading an article regarding AIDS in Haiti. Half of the class will be reading an article about the work of Dr. Paul Farmer and half the class will be reading about the work of Jean Pape.
   d. As the students read their article they will complete the T-charts. One is entitled “Haiti: Hope and Despair;” the second is entitled “The United States and Haiti: Hope and Despair.” Distribute the handouts and the readings (each student gets one reading and two handouts).

2. Read the articles – 10 minutes to read and complete the charts

3. Divide the students into two groups (the students with the same article will be working together) 15 minutes
   a. Explain to the students they will complete a chart for hope and a chart for despair, which they will share with their classmates
      i. the “Hope” chart will be divided in half. The top half will be hope from within Haiti and the bottom half will be hope from the U.S.
      ii. the “Despair” chart will be divided in half. The top half will be despair from within Haiti and the bottom half will be despair from the U.S.
   b. The students need to select one student to give a brief overview of the article to the class and four students who will present the “hope” and “despair”.

4. Students present their information to the class. After each presentation show the video clip from the Pulitzer Center about the article to the class.

5. Reflective Writing (Homework): Distribute scoring guides and discuss
   a. Option 1 – A three-paragraph persuasive essay supporting either
      i. “Haiti is an island of Hope” or
      ii. “Haiti is an island of Despair”
   b. Option 2 – An eight-block cartoon depicting Haiti as an island of hope and Haiti as an island of despair
AIDS – Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome

PEPFAR – President’s Emergency Plan for AIDS

Solidarity - A union of interests, purposes, or sympathies among members of a group; fellowship of responsibilities and interests (source: http://www.thefreedictionary.com)

TB – (tuberculosis) an infectious disease caused by the bacterium Mycobacterium tuberculosis that is transmitted through inhalation and is characterized by cough, fever, shortness of breath, weight loss, and the appearance of inflammatory substances and tubercles in the lungs. Tuberculosis is highly contagious and can spread to other parts of the body, especially in people with weakened immune systems. Although the incidence of the disease has declined since the introduction of antibiotic treatment in the 1950s, it is still a major public-health problem throughout the world, especially in Asia and Africa (source: http://www.thefreedictionary.com)

Extension Activities

1. Farmer argues, “We’ve got to do a better job of taking care of HIV, and the way to do that in the United States is the same as it’s done here – community health workers”
   a. Have the students’ research HIV care in the United States. Based on the research the students need to determine if the community health worker program would be effective in the United States.

   Web Resources
   a. UNAIDS 2006 Report

2. Show your SOLIDARITY – create an Acrostic poem using the word “solidarity” to describe how young people can support the global fight against the spread of AIDS.

Assessment Options

1. Persuasive Essay
   a. The students will write a three-paragraph persuasive essay
      i. “Haiti is an island of hope” or
      ii. “Haiti is an island of despair”
   b. Must include examples of the choice not selected (e.g. if the student chooses “hope” they must include examples of “despair” and counter them with a “hope” argument)

2. Cartoon Strip
   a. The students will create an eight-block cartoon illustrating hope and despair in Haiti.
   b. One block is the title, three blocks “hope”, three blocks “despair”, final block – which one is more prevalent
   c. Must include examples from both articles
January 28, 2003: President Bush delivers his State of the Union, in which he announces the Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR), a five-year, $15 billion initiative.

March 17, 2003: Legislation authorizing the President’s initiative is introduced in the House (HR1298).


February 23, 2004: “The Five-Year Strategy for the President’s Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief” outlines the implementation of and names Haiti as one of the 14 focus countries for PEPFAR programs (Vietnam is named later, raising the number of focus countries to 15).

February 26, 2004: USAID publishes a policy directive requiring foreign nongovernmental organizations to take a loyalty oath regarding prostitution. It requires organizations to have a specific policy against prostitution and sex trafficking as a condition for receiving U.S. global AIDS funding.

June 9, 2005: USAID expands its policy directive requiring a loyalty oath regarding prostitution to include all foreign and U.S.-based nongovernmental organizations.

U.S. funding is denied to DKT International, a Washington-based non-profit managing contraceptive social marketing programs for family planning and AIDS prevention, when the organization refuses to agree to the oath the policy required.

July 11, 2005: DKT International files a lawsuit challenging the U.S. government’s loyalty oath regarding prostitution on the grounds that it is an unconstitutional infringement of speech and that it undermines U.S. international efforts to stem the scourge of HIV/AIDS.

January 19, 2006: Ambassador Randall L. Tobias, is nominated to take over Andrew Natsios’ position as fourteenth Administrator of USAID.

April 27, 2007: Tobias resigns after his name turns up on phone records of a woman charged with running a prostitution ring.

February 27, 2007: A three-judge circuit appeals court panel upholds the anti-prostitution pledge.

(Sources: news reports, PEPFAR WATCH, a project of the Center for Health and Gender Equity, and The Global Gag Rule Impact Project)
**HAITI: HOPE AND DESPAIR**

Title of Article: ________________________________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HOPE</th>
<th>DESPAIR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE UNITED STATES AND HAITI: HOPE AND DESPAIR

Title of Article: _______________________________________________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HOPE</th>
<th>DESPAIR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**PERSUASIVE ESSAY: HAITI: AN ISLAND OF HOPE OR DESPAIR**

Teacher Name: ____________________________________________

Student Name: ____________________________________________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORY</th>
<th>4 Above Standards</th>
<th>3 Meets Standards</th>
<th>2 Approaching Standards</th>
<th>1 Below Standards</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Position Statement</strong></td>
<td>The position statement provides a clear, strong statement of the author's position on the topic.</td>
<td>The position statement provides a clear statement of the author’s position on the topic.</td>
<td>A position statement is present, but does not make the author’s position clear.</td>
<td>There is no position statement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Support for Position</strong></td>
<td>Includes 3 or more pieces of evidence (facts, statistics, examples, real-life experiences) that support the position statement. The writer anticipates the reader’s concerns, biases or arguments and has provided at least 1 counter-argument.</td>
<td>Includes 3 or more pieces of evidence (facts, statistics, examples, real-life experiences) that support the position statement.</td>
<td>Includes 2 pieces of evidence (facts, statistics, examples, real-life experiences) that support the position statement.</td>
<td>Includes 1 or fewer pieces of evidence (facts, statistics, examples, real-life experiences).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sequencing</strong></td>
<td>Arguments and support are provided in a logical order that makes it easy and interesting to follow the author’s train of thought.</td>
<td>Arguments and support are provided in a fairly logical order that makes it reasonably easy to follow the author’s train of thought.</td>
<td>A few of the support details or arguments are not in an expected or logical order, distracting the reader and making the essay seem a little confusing.</td>
<td>Many of the support details or arguments are not in an expected or logical order, distracting the reader and making the essay seem very confusing.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grammar &amp; Spelling</strong></td>
<td>Author makes no errors in grammar or spelling that distract the reader from the content.</td>
<td>Author makes 1-2 errors in grammar or spelling that distract the reader from the content.</td>
<td>Author makes 3-4 errors in grammar or spelling that distract the reader from the content.</td>
<td>Author makes more than 4 errors in grammar or spelling that distract the reader from the content.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Closing paragraph</strong></td>
<td>The conclusion is strong and leaves the reader solidly understanding the writer’s position. Effective restatement of the position statement begins the closing paragraph.</td>
<td>The conclusion is recognizable. The author’s position is restated within the first two sentences of the closing paragraph.</td>
<td>The author’s position is restated within the closing paragraph, but not near the beginning.</td>
<td>There is no conclusion - the paper just ends.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Making a Poster: Haiti An Island of Hope or Despair - Cartoon Strip

**Teacher Name:** ______________________________________________________

**Student Name:** _____________________________________________________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORY</th>
<th>4 Above Standards</th>
<th>3 Meets Standards</th>
<th>2 Approaching Standards</th>
<th>1 Below Standards</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Content - Accuracy</strong></td>
<td>At least 6 accurate facts are displayed on the cartoon.</td>
<td>4-5 accurate facts are displayed on the cartoon.</td>
<td>2-3 accurate facts are displayed on the cartoon.</td>
<td>Less than 2 accurate facts are displayed on the cartoon.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Required Elements</strong></td>
<td>The cartoon includes all 8 blocks and required elements as well as additional information. Title, 3 &quot;Hope&quot; 3 “Despair,” Conclusion.</td>
<td>All required elements are included in the cartoon.</td>
<td>All but 1 of the required elements are included in the cartoon.</td>
<td>Several required elements were missing.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Graphics - Relevance</strong></td>
<td>All graphics are related to the topic and make it easier to understand. All borrowed graphics have a source citation.</td>
<td>All graphics are related to the topic and most make it easier to understand. All borrowed graphics have a source citation.</td>
<td>All graphics relate to the topic. Most borrowed graphics have a source citation.</td>
<td>Graphics do not relate to the topic OR several borrowed graphics do not have a source citation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Attractiveness</strong></td>
<td>The cartoon strip is exceptionally attractive in terms of design, layout, and neatness.</td>
<td>The cartoon strip is attractively attractive in terms of design, layout and neatness.</td>
<td>The cartoon strip is acceptably attractive though it may be a bit messy.</td>
<td>The cartoon strip is distractingly messy or very poorly designed. It is not attractive.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mechanics</strong></td>
<td>Capitalization, punctuation and spelling are correct throughout the cartoon.</td>
<td>There is 1 error in capitalization, spelling or punctuation.</td>
<td>There are 2 errors in capitalization, spelling or punctuation.</td>
<td>There are more than 2 errors in capitalization, spelling or punctuation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>